

CIVCAS CELL INITIAL ASSESSMENT

Allegation #	777		
Source(s)	AIRWARS	Date Received	23 JUN 2017
Casualty Estimate	5-11 killed ; 15 injured		
Incident Date	11 DEC 2016		
Location	Kisham desert oil fields, eastern Deir Ezzor, Syria (IVO MGRS (b)(1)1.4a)		
Allegation	<p>December 11th 2016: كَشَام بادية Kisham desert oil fields, eastern Deir Ezzor, Syria</p> <p>Synopsis: Up to eleven civilians died in a Coalition airstrike which at the time was also blamed on Russia and the Assad regime airstrike. However the Coalition has confirmed striking oil installations and tankers in the vicinity on this date, and killing five drivers. According to Ara News, "Unidentified warplanes shelling oil refineries in Badeyet Kisham killed 10 workers and wounded 15. The number of death is likely to rise due to the seriousness of some injuries." Baladi News placed the initial death toll at 6, again citing unidentified warplanes.</p> <p>The FSA and Daral Akhbar blamed Russia, while the Syrian Network said the regime was responsible, as did Syrian Newsdesk which reported: "Seven civilians were killed, including three children, and 15 others wounded yesterday evening, due to regime warplanes targeting with four raids the town of Khisham which is under the control of the organization of the Islamic state east of Deir al-Zour city."</p> <p>Shaam News initially blamed Russia, but later said the Coalition was responsible for 11 civilians killed. Syrian PC also reported that "Coalition warplanes carried raids in Badeyet Al kisham oil fields and killed 11 civilians – most are drivers and civilians who work in the industry – and wounded dozens. The death toll is likely to rise due to serious injuries."</p> <p>Deir Ezzor 24 named three victims: Nour Al-Deen Sabah A'-Amash Ibrahim Ali Albadran Jassam Ramadar Al Salch</p> <p>The Coalition noted in February 2017 that the incident was still being assessed. On March 4th it confirmed responsibility: "Dec. 11, 2016, near Dayr Az Zayr, Syria, via self-report: During a strike on an ISIS oil tanker trucks it is assessed that five civilians were unintentionally killed. After warning shots were fired truck drivers vacated their vehicles and moved a safe distance away. Aircraft engaged targets and following munition release five of the drivers returned to their vehicles and were killed by munition's impact."</p> <p>Civilians reported killed: 5-11, including 3 children Civilians reported injured: 15</p> <p>Sources: Ara News [Arabic] [Archived], Free Syrian Army Forum [Arabic] [Archived], Deir Ezzor 24 [Arabic] [Archived], Baladi News [Arabic] [Archived], Syrian Observatory for Human Rights [Arabic] [Archived], Syrian News [Arabic] [Archived], Daral Akbar [Arabic] [Archived], Syrian Network for Human Rights [Archived], Al Jisr TV [Arabic] [Archived], Euphrates Post (1) [Arabic] [Archived], Euphrates Post (2) [Arabic] [Archived], Deir Ezzor and Raqqa Legal Network [Arabic] [Archived], Radio al Kul [Arabic] [Archived], Shaam News Network (1) [Arabic] [Archived],</p>		

	<p>Shaam News Network (2) [Arabic] [Archived], Syrian PC [Arabic] [Archived], LCCSY [Arabic] [Archived], Syrian Newsdesk [Arabic] [Archived], Coalition civilian casualty report (February 2017), Coalition monthly civcas report (March 2017),</p> <p>Quality of reporting: CONFIRMED COALITION INCIDENT</p> <p>Coalition position: For December 10th-11th 2016, the Coalition publicly reported that "Near Dayr Az Zawr, three strikes destroyed five oil well heads, an oil storage tank, and an oil tanker truck." For December 11th-12th it also noted that "Near Dayr Az Zawr, one strike destroyed eight oil tanker trucks."</p> <p>Quality of Reporting: Contested Russia</p>
<p>Analysis</p>	<p>1. Is this allegation a self-report? NO If yes, add details of corroborating strike below and task a CCAR. If no, move to 2.</p> <p>2. Does the allegation include</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a) video/photo evidence of CIVCAS NO b) a general location, e.g., Tabaqah, Manbij, Tel Afar; if in Mosul, or similarly sized city, must provide neighborhoods, e.g., Zanjili. Kisham desert oil fields AND c) a way to identify the date or a 48 hour date range? 11 DEC 2016 <p>If yes to all three, move to 6. If any are no, then move to number 3.</p> <p>3. Does the allegation contain a</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a) General Day, YES AND b) Specific location, e.g., MGRS or specific building? NO <p>If yes to the two, then move to 6. If any are no, move to number 4.</p> <p>4.a. Is the allegation from a single source NO (even if there are multiple sources, look at whether the sources lack independence, i.e., all derived from one source)? If yes, move to 4.b. If no, move to 5.</p> <p>4.b. Is the single source a high quality source OR does it provide specific facts that may warrant a CCAR. If yes, move to 6. If no, then move to 4.c.</p> <p>4.c. Has media interviewed witnesses and/or victims? If yes, then contact journalist and re-assess. If no, then close the allegation.</p> <p>5.a. Are any of the sources high quality? YES If yes, move to 6. If no, move to 5.b.</p> <p>5.b. Are there at least two corroborating sources (total of 3) that independently reported the allegation, OR does it provide specific facts that may warrant a CCAR? If yes, move to 6. If no, close the allegation.</p> <p>6. Does the allegation contain sufficient information on the time, location and details to make an assessment of credibility? YES</p>

	<p>I.e., does it provide enough information to determine the date within 48 hour; does it provide enough information to determine a neighborhood, landmark, or other way to where the alleged incident occurred within a .5km radius? If yes, move to 7. If no, close the allegation.</p> <p>7. Are there any potentially corroborating strikes? NO If yes, answer the below questions and task CCAR. If no, close allegation.</p>
Non-US Coalition Involvement	
Decision	Close Allegation; insufficient evidence to corroborate the allegation
Report Approved By:	<div>(b)(3) 10 USC 130b; (b)(6)</div>

Page 232 redacted for the following reason:

Exhibits removed per agreement - Bates Number 4028

Approved for Release