

## CIVCAS CELL INITIAL ASSESSMENT

<b>Allegation #</b>	773		
<b>Source(s)</b>	AIRWARS	<b>Date Received</b>	22 JUN 2017
<b>Casualty Estimate</b>	40 killed		
<b>Incident Date</b>	7 DEC 2016		
<b>Location</b>	Tal Abtah (Tal Afar), Nineveh Province, Iraq (TVO MGRS: (b)(1)1.4a		
<b>Allegation</b>	<p><b>December 8th 2016: Tal Abtah (Tal Afar), Nineveh Province, Iraq</b>  <b>Synopsis:</b> Yaqein reported that more than 40 civilians, including civilians, were killed in Iraqi government bombing. Citing a source, they said that there were 42 victims. Al Hadath, citing the Iraqi Ministry of Defense, also cited government airstrikes in Tel Abtah, but said that they killed "42 terrorists, and destroyed three cars, one carrying" members of ISIL. A Facebook account – Forth Theory – also cited more than 40 civilian deaths. In an emailed response to a report submitted by Airwars on this and other incidents in December 2016, Coalition officials said the event was presently assessed as 'Not credible.' Civilians reported killed: 42, including women and children  Civilians reported injured: unknown  Sources: Yaqein [Arabic] [Archived], Al Hadath [Arabic] [Archived], Forth Theory [Arabic] [Archived],  Quality of reporting: Discounted Coalition reports indicate it was the Iraqi government.  <b>ASSESSED INCIDENT</b>  Coalition position: For December 7th-8th, the Coalition reported no strikes near Tal Afar. For December 8th-9th, the Coalition reported no strikes near Tal Afar.</p> <p><b>Quality of Reporting:</b> Discounted Coalition – reports indicate it was the Iraqi government.</p>		
<b>Analysis</b>	<p>1. Is this allegation a self-report? <b>NO</b> If yes, add details of corroborating strike below and task CCAR. If no, move to 2.</p> <p>2. Does the allegation include</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a) video/photo evidence of CIVCAS <b>NO</b></li> <li>b) a general location, e.g., Tabaqah, Manbij, Tel Afar; if in Mosul, or similarly sized city, must provide neighborhoods, e.g., Zanjili. <b>Tal Afar</b> AND</li> <li>c) a way to identify the date or a 48 hour date range? <b>8 DEC 2016</b></li> </ul> <p>If yes to all three, move to 6. If any are no, then move to number 3.</p> <p>3. Does the allegation contain a</p>		

	<p>a) General Day, <b>YES</b> AND b) Specific location, e.g., MGRS or specific building? <b>NO</b></p> <p>If yes to the two, then move to 6. If any are no, move to number 4.</p> <p><b>4.a.</b> Is the allegation from a single source <b>NO</b> (even if there are multiple sources, look at whether the sources lack independence, i.e., all derived from one source)? If yes, move to 4.b. If no, move to 5.</p> <p><b>4.b.</b> Is the single source a high quality source <b>OR</b> does it provide specific facts that may warrant a CCAR. If yes, move to 6. If no, then move to 4.c.</p> <p><b>4.c.</b> Has media interviewed witnesses and/or victims? If yes, then contact journalist and re-assess. If no, then close the allegation.</p> <p><b>5.a.</b> Are any of the sources high quality? <b>NO</b> If yes, move to 6. If no, move to 5.b.</p> <p><b>5.b.</b> Are there at least two corroborating sources (total of 3) that independently reported the allegation, <b>OR</b> does it provide specific facts that may warrant a CCAR? If yes, move to 6. If no, close the allegation.</p> <p><b>6.</b> Does the allegation contain sufficient information on the time, location and details to make an assessment of credibility? <b>NO</b></p> <p>I.e., does it provide enough information to determine the date within 48 hour; does it provide enough information to determine a neighborhood, landmark, or other way to where the alleged incident occurred within a .5km radius? <b>YES</b> If yes, move to 7. If no, close the allegation.</p> <p><b>7.</b> Are there any potentially corroborating strikes? If yes, answer the below questions and task CCAR. If no, close allegation.</p> <p><b>No Coalition strikes in Tal Afar between 6-8 December 2016. Allegation cites GoI strikes. Coalition was not engaging in strikes in Tal Afar in December 2016. Focus was – Mosul.</b></p>
<b>Non-US Coalition Involvement</b>	
<b>Decision</b>	<b>Close Allegation; insufficient evidence to corroborate the allegation.</b>
<b>Report Approved By:</b>	(b)(3) 10 USC 130b; (b)(6)

Approved for Release