

CIVCAS CELL INITIAL ASSESSMENT

Allegation #	887		
Source(s)	Airwars.org	Date Received	05 JUL 17
Casualty Estimate	Killed: 17-24 Injured: 2+		
Incident Date	11-13 FEB 17		
Location	Al Bab City, SY (MGRS: (b)(1)1.4a		
Allegation	<p>February 13th 2017: الباب al Bab city, Aleppo governorate, Syria Summary: At least 15 civilians from the same family died in either Turkish or Coalition airstrikes, as the battle to seize Al Bab from ISIL continued. Up to nine other non-combatants also died.</p> <p>Al Jazeera initially placed the death toll at 16 and then 24, though said the fatalities resulted from "shelling and battles in the city." The Syrian Network blamed the Coalition for the deaths of "17 civilians, including 3 children and 5 women", while LCCSY reported "21 martyrs in Aleppo killed in Turkish air and artillery bombardment on al Bab." According to Shaam News "Al A'amaq agency [ISIL] reported that Turkish aircraft and aircraft of the international coalition launched more than 20 air raid on the city's neighborhoods, as has been targeting residential neighborhoods with more than 250 artillery shells and grenades."</p> <p>Al Bab Coordination issued the following list of 17 victims:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Abdo Ahmad Kazkaz Ahmad Ali Kazkaz Mohammad Ali Kazkaz Abdo the son of Ahmad Abdo Kazkaz Mohammad the son of Mohammad Ali Kazkaz Mohannand Mohammad Ali Kazkaz Fattoum Kazkaz [female] Sahar Kazkaz [female] Subhi Misto Kazkaz Alia Kazkaz [female] Badriya Hajj Abdo [female] Khaled Haj Abdo Mohammad Haj Abdo Sobhi Kazkaz Dalal Kazkaz [female] Abdul-Mo'ti Al-Waki Radwan, son of Abdul-Mo'til Al-Waki <p>Civilians reported killed: 17-24, including 3 children and 5 women Civilians reported injured: 2 or more</p> <p>Sources: Al Bab Coordination Committee – casualty list [Arabic] [Archived], Al Jazeera [Arabic] [Archived], Aleppo Media Centre [Arabic] [Archived], Al Jazeera (2) [Arabic] [Archived], Syrian Network for Human Rights [Archived], LCCSY [Arabic] [Archived], Al</p>		

	<p>Bab 24 (1) – casualty list [Arabic] [Archived], Step News [Arabic] [Archived], ANHA News [Arabic] [Archived], Shaam News Network [Arabic] [Archived], Syria News Desk [Arabic] [Archived],</p> <p>Quality of reporting: Contested Turkey or Coalition</p> <p>RFI Response:</p> <p>5e. February 13th 2017: (S الباب (435 Bab city, Aleppo governorate, Syria The incident was reported to have happened on New Street (Al Jadid Street, شارع الجدى الجديد), centre of Al Bab city, Aleppo governorate: 36.370528, 37.517881. However, as geospatial information on Al Bab is limited, the coordinates are not 100% accurate. That said, the sources do confirm the incident happened on ‘New Street’ and that it was a residential building.</p> <p>Al Jazeera mentions “shelling and battles in the city” due to warplane raid. Some sources, including Al Bab 24, claimed that it was “Turkish planes” or Turkish and international forces that targeted a residential building.</p> <p>Time: Before 20:00 local time</p> <p>Additional Information: More accurate coordinates: <input type="text" value="(b)(1)1.4a"/> [exact location]</p>
<p>Analysis</p>	<p>1. Is this allegation a self-report? NO If yes, add details of corroborating strike below and task a CCAR. If no, move to 2.</p> <p>2. Does the allegation include</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a) video/photo evidence of CIVCAS? NO b) a general location, YES <p>AND</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> c) a way to identify the date or a 48 hour date range? YES <p>If yes to all three, move to 6. If any are no, then move to number 3.</p> <p>3. Does the allegation contain a</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a) General Day, YES <p>AND</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> b) Specific location, e.g., MGRS or specific building? NO <p>If yes to the two, then move to 6. If any are no, move to number 4.</p> <p>4.a. Is the allegation from a single source (even if there are multiple sources, look at whether the sources lack independence, i.e., all derived from one source)? NO If yes, move to 4.b. If no, move to 5.</p> <p>4.b. Is the single source a high quality source OR does it provide specific facts that may warrant a CCAR. If yes, move to 6. If no, then move to 4.e.</p> <p>4.c. Has media interviewed witnesses and/or victims? If yes, then contact journalist and re-assess. If no, then close the allegation.</p> <p>5.a. Are any of the sources high quality? YES If yes, move to 6. If no, move to 5.b.</p> <p>5.b. Are there at least two corroborating sources (total of 3) that independently reported the allegation, OR does it provide specific facts that may warrant a CCAR? If yes, move to 6. If no, close the allegation.</p>

	<p>6. Does the allegation contain sufficient information on the time, location and details to make an assessment of credibility? YES I.e., does it provide enough information to determine the date within 48 hour; does it provide enough information to determine a neighborhood, landmark, or other way to where the alleged incident occurred within a .5km radius? If yes, move to 7. If no, close the allegation.</p> <p>7. Are there any potentially corroborating strikes? If yes, answer the below questions and task CCAR. If no, close allegation. NO</p> <p>MAT – 0 strikes CAOC – 0 strikes CJTF kmz – 0 strikes CJTF log – 0 strikes</p>
Non-US Coalition Involvement	N/A
Decision	<p>Close the IA due to insufficient evidence to corroborate the allegation.</p> <p>1. Even after receiving exact location data from Airwars, there are no strikes in the City of Al Bab or on New Street.</p>
Report Approved By:	

Page 218 redacted for the following reason:

Exhibits removed per agreement - Bates Number 4646

Approved for Release